



European Network Against Racism
Réseau européen contre le racisme
Europäisches Netz gegen Rassismus

General Policy Paper No. 7

Roma Inclusion: A Progressive and Rights-Based Approach

DRAFT 2

October 2011

The European Network against Racism (ENAR) is a network of some 700 NGOs working to combat racism in all EU Member States. ENAR is determined to fight racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance, to promote equality of treatment between EU citizens and third country nationals, and to link local/regional/national and European initiatives.

Introduction

This seventh General Policy Paper by the European Network against Racism (ENAR) is the product of ongoing concern and reflection regarding the development of progressive integration and social inclusion policies as a tool to combat racism. It comes at a time shortly after the EU designed and adopted a European Framework for National Roma Integration Strategies, an important step in acknowledging politically the need to improve Roma integration policies. Already working on Roma issues for several years, the ENAR Network and its Members are refining through this General Policy Paper ENAR's approach to Roma inclusion on the basis of its new strategic goal: to "articulate and promote a progressive narrative that recognises the benefits of a racism-free Europe". By stressing the importance of equality and diversity for a vibrant European society and economy, ENAR's narrative should be implemented inter alia by promoting effective participation of ethnic and religious minorities in all spheres of society, including specifically employment, public administration, education, culture, and sport.¹

As a preliminary remark, ENAR recognises that the Roma are not a homogeneous group, as the Roma identity has come to be applied to a wide range of minority communities throughout Europe. The term derives from the Romani word for a man/person and is the traditional appellation for some, mainly Romani speaking group. However, some individuals and groups within this community prefer to use alternative terminology and self-identifications, which should be acknowledged and respected. The EU institutions are using the term "Roma" as an umbrella term to include groups of people who share more or less similar cultural characteristics, such as the Roma, Sinti, Travellers, Ashkali, and Kalé.² These groups also share a history of persistent marginalisation in European societies. While no official data on ethnicity is available across the EU, it is estimated that the Roma compose 10 to 12 million people in the EU, making them the largest minority in that same territory.³

Analysis of the current situation

Roma inclusion presents significant difficulties due to the complex combination of issues related to ethnicity, civil status and access to personal documents, participation and representation, socio-economic status and culture of the Roma and Traveller population. They also face challenges related to institutional discrimination and political and popular hostilities as well as anti-Gypsyism, the last of which is a specific and long established form of racism. Tackling the structural and systemic inequalities affecting the Roma requires a comprehensive and multidimensional approach.

The European Union Minorities and Discrimination Survey (EU-MIDIS), published in 2009, reveals that on average – "every second Roma respondent was discriminated against at least once in the previous 12 months" and "Roma who were discriminated against experienced on average 11 incidents of discrimination over a 12 months period". This is combined with high rates of being victim of personal crime (1/4) and victims of racially motivated crime (1/5). Additionally, findings show low reporting rates largely due to a lack of confidence that the victims could be helped.⁴

Apart from the human rights argument on the necessity to improve the situation of the most excluded Roma, their integration is a necessary investment and would provide numerous benefits, including financially. For instance, if the employment rate of Roma could be raised to that of the majority, the overall rate of employment would be increased by 5% to 10%, depending on the proportion

¹ ENAR Strategic Plan 2011-2013.

² For ease in language, reference is made to Roma in this policy paper, but it may be used interchangeably with these other groups, depending on the particular case.

³ European Union Agency for Fundamental Rights, The Fundamental Rights Position of Roma and Travellers in the European Union (factsheet), August 2010: http://fra.europa.eu/fraWebsite/attachments/roma-travellers-factsheet_en.pdf.

⁴ European Union Agency for Fundamental Rights, EU-MIDIS Data in Focus Report, The Roma, 2009.

of Roma population in the country. According to the World Bank,⁵ increasing labour market participation is indispensable for facilitating economic growth, especially requiring the participation of those of an economically active age but who are unemployed. In many Member States, Roma represent a significant and growing proportion of the school age population and future workers. The Roma population is young: 35.7% are under 15 compared to 15.7% of the EU population overall. The average age is 25 among Roma, compared with 40 across the EU.⁶ Roma therefore comprise a significant and permanently growing percentage of the necessary resources for increasing labour market participation and - according to modest estimations - potentially triggering a 4 to 6 % growth of national GDPs⁷. This is more than any European country spends on national security.⁸

On the other hand, the costs of non-inclusion are high, including wasted education expenditures such as the cost of segregated and/or low standard schools that fail to provide quality education.⁹ Perhaps more importantly, growing inequality has consequences that go far beyond economic considerations. Inequality causes shorter, unhealthier and unhappier lives for all; it increases the rate of teenage pregnancy, violence, obesity, imprisonment and addiction; it destroys relationships between individuals born in the same society but into different classes; and its function as a driver of consumption depletes the planet's resources.¹⁰ Working to foster equality is therefore beneficial for the well-being of all, not only for people in situation of or at risk of social exclusion. Pushing for equal treatment in education, housing or health is likely to improve the overall quality of life, social cohesion, and enhance emotional well-being, feelings of trust and belonging in European societies.

EU level legislative and policy developments

At the EU level, several important legislative developments have contributed to the establishment of a framework for protection against racism and discrimination for EU citizens, that should benefit Roma, including the 2000 Equality Directives, the Framework Decision on combating certain forms and expressions of racism and xenophobia, the Lisbon Treaty and the Charter of Fundamental Rights. Roma related issues have been mainstreamed to a certain extent in EU economic and social policies, and support for Roma has been provided by the EU structural funds. Furthermore, ten Common Basic Principles for Roma Inclusion were developed and annexed to the Council Conclusions in June 2009.

However, the EU has lacked a strategic comprehensive approach to Roma inclusion, and no real progress has been noticed in the situation of Roma communities. Events in France in the summer of 2010 raised attention to the need for a comprehensive strategy at EU-level to address the deep poverty and social exclusion faced by the Roma. Policy makers across Europe realized the significance of pursuing this issue, particularly since such a step had been long recommended by the European Parliament and civil society, including ENAR as well. The last European Parliament Resolution on 8 March 2011 and prior to the release of the European Framework for National Roma Integration

⁵ DE LAAT, Joost ed. 2010 *Economic costs of Roma exclusion*. World Bank, available at:

http://siteresources.worldbank.org/EXTROMA/Resources/Economic_Costs_Roma_Exclusion_Note_Final.pdf

⁶European Commission DG Education LLL call „Promotion the Integration of Roma in and through Education”, http://eacea.ec.europa.eu/llp/funding/2011/call_roma_2011_en.php

⁷ DE LAAT, Joost ed. 2010 *Economic costs of Roma exclusion*. World Bank, available at:

http://siteresources.worldbank.org/EXTROMA/Resources/Economic_Costs_Roma_Exclusion_Note_Final.pdf

⁸ Lívia Járóka, WORKING DOCUMENT on Report on the EU strategy on Roma inclusion Committee on Civil Liberties, Justice and Home Affairs.

⁹ MARCINČIN A. and MARCINČINOVÁ Ľ. *The Cost of Non-Inclusion - The key to integration is respect for diversity*. Open Society Foundation, Bratislava, available at:

http://www.romadecade.org/files/ftp/Publications/2_cost_of_non_inclusion.pdf

¹⁰ The Spirit Level: Why More Equal Societies Almost Always Do Better' [Richard G. Wilkinson](#) and Kate Pickett, Allen Lane, 2009.

Strategies, called on the Commission to link social inclusion priorities to a clear set of objectives including:

- the protection of citizens against discrimination in all fields of life;
- the promotion of social dialogue between Roma and non-Roma to combat racism and xenophobia; and
- the Commission, as guardian of the treaties, is to ensure full implementation of relevant legislation and appropriate sanctions against racially motivated crime.¹¹

The Framework, as proposed by the European Commission, is far from fulfilling the recommendations of the European Parliament: it fails to specify measures to combat discrimination, intimidation, anti-Gypsyism, hate speech and/or violence against Roma. The European Commission approach has a strong economic and social focus, requesting all Member States to develop and implement dedicated long-term strategies to promote Roma integration in four key areas: access to education, healthcare, employment, and housing and essential services. It also seeks to allocate sufficient targeted resources to achieve progress. However, the Framework falls far short of fully tackling the challenges of Roma exclusion, which are intimately linked to widespread hostility and discrimination against the Roma people. This approach was somewhat balanced by the Council of the European Union, which states that it is empowered to take appropriate action to combat discrimination and invites the Commission to “pursue rigorous monitoring of the implementation of Council Directive 2000/43/EC”.¹² Overall, the adoption of the Framework is a significant step forward and has the potential to make a difference by 2020 if efforts at all levels are upheld.

ENAR approach to Roma inclusion

The approach to Roma integration and social inclusion policies need to be based on a “whole society vision, guaranteeing ‘security, equality and prosperity for all’ by maximising the potential of all, towards developing confident and strong communities, integrated and cohesive societies, as well as a stable and prosperous Europe”.¹³ This should be firmly grounded in a human rights-based approach ensuring anti-racism and anti-discrimination through a common set of rights for all. It requires the active participation of Roma themselves to go beyond rhetoric and make Roma integration a reality. Consequently this paper elaborates four key principles:

1. A positive political discourse must be promoted
2. Respect and fulfilment of fundamental rights must be the basis of Roma inclusion policies
3. Active citizenship is essential to Roma inclusion and civic participation must be enhanced
4. Effective policymaking and implementation must be ensured at all levels

¹¹ Report on the EU Strategy on Roma Inclusion (2010/2276(INI))Committee on Civil liberties, Justice and Home Affairs, <http://www.europarl.europa.eu/sides/getDoc.do?type=REPORT&reference=A7-2011-0043&language=EN>.

¹² Council of the European Union (2011), *Council Conclusions on an EU Framework for National Roma Integration Strategies up to 2020*, paragraph 30.

¹³ ENAR Strategic Plan 2011-2013.

1. A positive political discourse must be promoted

Currently, there is a lack of a “positive visibility” of Roma within society. Roma are often perceived as foreigners, demonised and dehumanised at a time when the EU needs a vision of hope in which diversity is an asset for our common future. The need is therefore urgent to challenge the underlying perceptions and assumptions surrounding Roma populations, which are increasingly enhanced by the negative and racist discourses by politicians, policy-makers and the mass media. The Council of the European Union recognises this situation and invited the Commission and Member States:

40. to foster positive changes in attitudes towards Roma by improving public awareness of Roma culture and identity and combating stereotypes, xenophobia and racism.¹⁴

An approach framed by the respect for human rights and recognition of the positive nature of diversity in Europe needs to be upheld.

ENAR calls on the European Union to:

- Promote its essential values, conceptions, and principles when addressing Roma related issues
 - An approach that is consistent with European core values of respect for human dignity, freedom, democracy, equality, the rule of law and respect for human rights, including the rights of persons belonging to minorities must be promoted;
 - Policies and practices related to Roma inclusion must contribute to the vision of a Europe without racism;
 - The political debate about Roma must be reframed into a debate about the future of European societies as a whole;
 - Roma must be considered and treated as human beings and citizens, with full recognition of their distinct identities and cultures, and not as mere economic units;
 - The economic, social and cultural importance Roma could have to European society must be recognised;
 - The focus should be on presenting Roma integration as an opportunity with a constructive approach;
 - As long as it is voluntary, the mobility of Roma should be valued as a key contribution to the European project;
 - An honest debate should take place about the fears and widespread concerns from the general public have in regard to Roma; the rights of minorities cannot be successfully defended when the fears of majorities are neglected;
 - The use of “threat” arguments should be avoided (e.g. “if you don’t have a European Roma Strategy, you risk having more migration” – it presents mobility in a negative way);
 - Policy-makers should stop trying to “fix” the Roma or consider all of them as deviant;
 - The European Institutions must systematically bring attention to and overtly condemn racist incidents and violence;
 - A zero tolerance policy must be implemented towards stigmatising comments and terminology likely to incite xenophobia, racism, anti-Gypsyism or other forms of discrimination towards Roma by public authorities at all levels.

- Make use of data, invest in research, and challenge stereotypes

¹⁴ Council of the European Union (2011), *Council Conclusions on an EU Framework for National Roma Integration Strategies up to 2020*.

- Demographic and other statistics should be linked with all aspects of Roma integration and publicised in order to challenge stereotypes and misperceptions of Roma people and to more effectively determine the problems they face
- Qualitative and quantitative research should be produced with a focus on the benefits of Roma inclusion for the whole of society
 - o Advance research on the impact of the lack of action, and the cost of Roma non-inclusion
 - o Advance research on the economic potential and hidden talents within Roma communities, including Roma women
 - o Highlight and research the consequences of inequality
- Real-life success stories of Roma people and strengthening human rights approaches to social inclusion policies should be widely shared.

ENAR calls on national governments to:

- Use positive terminology in the political discourse when addressing Roma related issues
 - Public authorities must promote a fair and realistic image of Roma;
 - Hiring Roma people within the media must be encouraged to help present an ethnically diverse picture of society and prevent the dominance of negative portrayal of Roma.
 - Strategic alliances must be built within mainstream and community-based media to promote fair and realistic images.
 - A positive approach to inclusion and the need to strengthen confidence must be promoted within Roma communities.
- Make use of data, invest in research, and challenge stereotypes
 - Progress must be made in collecting disaggregated data for monitoring the situation of Roma on a strictly anonymous, voluntary and self-defining basis and in compliance with the rules on the protection of personal data in order to shed more insight to inclusion policies and to challenge stereotypes;
 - Roma should be involved throughout the research process (e.g. as researchers, assistant researchers or data collectors). When not possible, use voluntary Roma people and train them for an assistant position. Ideally, Roma participants should be interviewed by Roma interviewers to ensure greater disclosure and to overcome mistrust towards public institutions;
 - The lack of disaggregated data must not be used as an excuse for inaction; other tools such as situation testing can be used for proving unequal treatment.

2. Respect and fulfilment of fundamental rights must be the basis of Roma inclusion policies

The EU must provide protection to all persons living and working in its territory and fully implement and respect the Treaty of Lisbon and the now binding Charter of Fundamental Rights. It must ensure that the Charter means something to EU citizens in practice, namely Article 21, which states that:

“Any discrimination based on any ground such as sex, race, colour, ethnic or social origin, genetic features, language, religion or belief, political or any other opinion, membership of a national minority, property, birth, disability, age or sexual orientation shall be prohibited.”

Protecting Roma populations from discrimination is a particularly burning issue, as research from the European Union Agency for Fundamental Rights reveals.¹⁵ Regarding the Roma populations, unequal treatment was often not viewed particularly in the “new” Member States, as discrimination but rather as the consequence of the “way Roma choose to live”. In addition, Roma were often not considered as “deserving of protection” against discrimination, as a result.

Respect for human rights is not only an obligation of the EU and its Member States by law, it is also a prerequisite for successful inclusion policies. Indeed, respect for human rights creates more cohesive and stable societies, and stable societies generate stronger growth and economic development.

ENAR calls on the European Union to:

- Ensure the respect and fulfilment of fundamental rights
 - Roma must be acknowledged as an official European minority;
 - Anti-Gypsyism must be recognized as a specific form of racism;
 - The EU institutions must respond strongly and swiftly to infringements of minority rights by all Member States with no exception, the European Commission’s role as guardian of the Treaties must be strengthened and protected;
 - Human rights driven solutions to intra-European migration of Roma must be found: mobility is often due to hardship and discrimination, and there is an EU responsibility to ensure the safety of its citizens and freedom of movement without discrimination, including the right to work and right to social protection for Roma when they exercise their freedom of movement ;
 - An immediate end to forced evictions and expulsions must ensue by ensuring the respect of the ECHR and of the Directive on Free Movement.

- Ensure anti-discrimination for all
 - The exceptions on nationality and legal status should be removed from the EU anti-discrimination directives;
 - The European Community should sign the International Convention on the elimination of all forms of racial discrimination, as all Member States have already ratified it, just as it has done for the UN Convention on the rights of people with disabilities;
 - Multiple discrimination and exclusion must be addressed by including specific measures for Roma women, children, people with disabilities, HIV positive people, migrants, LGBT people, older people, etc.

- Respect the links between anti-discrimination, integration, and social inclusion
 - Policy- and decision-makers must adopt a holistic and coherent approach to Roma integration and recognise that anti-discrimination and access to rights are prerequisites for successful integration strategies;
 - Greater awareness raising on and consideration of the Common Basic Principles on Roma Inclusion is needed; the principles should be operationalised and used as guiding principles for designing policies;
 - Guidance should be sought from the Recommendations adopted by the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe on Roma and Travellers.¹⁶

¹⁵ ‘The impact of the Racial Equality Directive - Views of trade unions and employers in the European Union (Strengthening the fundamental rights architecture in the EU IV)’:
http://www.fra.europa.eu/fraWebsite/research/publications/publications_per_year/2010/pub_racial_equal_directive_en.htm

ENAR calls on the Member States to:

- Ensure the respect and fulfilment of fundamental rights
 - Racist violence against Roma must be tackled and sentenced, the Framework Decision against Racism and Xenophobia must be fully implemented;
 - Every child must have a right to a nationality: the lack of a birth certificate, identity card or other legal document prevents many Roma from acquiring citizenship, a residence permit, or access to essential services;
 - Human rights violations both against and within Romani communities must be addressed, with special attention on protecting Romani women and children.

- Ensure anti-discrimination for all
 - Discriminatory policing and ethnic profiling that target the Roma communities must be stopped. Studies show that ethnic profiling is counterproductive and alienates people whose cooperation would be useful for crime detection;
 - An immediate end to segregation in education and in health services must ensue;
 - Sensitivity to cultural difference must not be used as an excuse for different treatment;
 - Romani monitors should be employed to help win the confidence of victims;
 - National Strategies on Roma Integration should include strong anti-discrimination and awareness-raising measures to tackle prejudice, discrimination and anti-Gypsyism as a precondition for inclusion.

- Respect the links between anti-discrimination, integration, and social inclusion
 - Integration must not be used as a means to restrict human rights of a minority and must not exclude or discriminate on any ground, whether on the basis of race, nationality, social or any other status;
 - Welfare and social protection systems must be effectively universal in their benefits, and Roma people should be able to equally access public services;
 - Measures that have synergetic effects, improving the quality of life of Roma as well as the relationship with non-Roma must be implemented;
 - Policies and programmes should address diversity with a focus on the individual, tackling both the situation of Roma living in poverty and those out of poverty who experience racism, discrimination and exclusion;
 - Positive action should be promoted by Member States and local authorities for Roma inclusion in employment, education, health and housing, and for their political participation;
 - Where possible, there should be an increased involvement of qualified Roma in healthcare, housing, employment and education services targeting their communities;
 - Roma mediators should be trained and employed as an intermediate measure to build confidence between institutions and Roma;
 - Reasonable accommodation of Roma cultures and identities should be an explicit duty imposed by equality legislation on employers and service providers, provided this does not impose a disproportionate burden;
 - Inclusion policies should encompass the different segments of Roma communities ensuring that the most marginalised groups (women, youth, persons with disabilities, elderly and others) are included.

¹⁶ For instance, recommendations in the following areas: General Policies: Rec(2008)5; Health: Rec(2006)10; Housing: Rec(2005)4; Employment: Rec(2001)17; Education: No R (2000)4 and CM/Rec(2009)4.

3. Active citizenship is essential to Roma inclusion and civic participation must be enhanced

The EU should be an inclusive democracy, taking into account all people who are living in its territory, and should develop ways for everyone to fully participate and create a true European public space that is vital for the European integration process and serves society as a whole, while also stimulating community and individual development.

The concept of active citizenship is vague in most parts of the EU and has never been clearly linked to anti-discrimination and equality. Because of discrimination, racism and general everyday negative attitudes, a significant number of Roma are not or do not see or consider themselves as equal citizens and, unfortunately, there are still many who act as non-citizens, with the result that the majority opinion views Roma as not worthy of being treated as citizens. Other challenges include a tradition of peace and history of oppression of Roma people, leading to an absence of reactions in the face of discrimination and violence, and a disconnection between communities and political elite (both their own and the majority).

The Council Conclusions on May 2011 invite the Commission in cooperation with the Member States:

41. to promote the empowerment, active involvement and necessary participation of Roma themselves, at all levels of policy development, decision-making and implementation of measures, including by raising awareness of their rights and duties, as well as to consolidate the capacity of Roma NGOs and encourage the better involvement of civil society and all other stakeholders.

ENAR urges the European Institutions and the Member States to:

➤ Ensure voter and citizen's empowerment:

- Voters registration must be supported;
- Ways to stimulate responsibilities linked to citizenship of excluded Roma must be found;
- Skills-building programmes, information, education, awareness raising and funding must seek to empower Roma to understand and embrace the concept of citizenship, including awareness on the rights and responsibilities intrinsic with citizenship;
- The establishment of formal and informal civic structures that help Roma feel confident must be facilitated:
 - to develop and make decisions about policy choices;
 - to voice own concerns, act collectively where appropriate, develop pressure and hold public officials accountable.;
 - to articulate concerns in relation to the interests of overall territorial community, to advance towards a whole society vision, which is the starting point of changing the negative image majority citizens have of Roma;
- Political parties must do more outreach activities to challenge widespread mistrust and actively give Roma access to elected positions;
- Capacity building and direct investment must be prioritised to bolster the civic sector.
- Corruption and the problem of buying votes must be addressed to enhance control and democratic monitoring at local level.

➤ Provide adequate structure for participation and the Roma voice

- The direct involvement of Roma in decision-making and policy development and implementation on issues that impact Roma inclusion must be ensured at local, national and EU levels as a key success factor;
- Participation must take the form of a meaningful and continuous dialogue between Roma people and organisations, civil society, local authorities, Member States, relevant international organisations and European institutions;
- Forums must be avoided that grant Roma formal involvement but do not provide for any meaningful influence on policy processes. For instance, the European Commission should ensure that the European Roma Platform can be used as a tool for Roma representatives and representatives of civil society to input on policies;
- The role of Roma representatives and anti-racist organisations should be acknowledged as watchdogs, guaranteeing that legislation and policy do not lead to unlawful discrimination against Roma;
- Adequate structures for participation, which can make the Roma voice heard and challenge institutional and societal discrimination, require a long-term and strong investment into the self-organization of Roma on the grassroots level and into their networking on regional, national and international level, with a specific attention to women and young people;
- Policy-making and implementation processes must be open and transparent;
- Active participation of civil society and specifically of Roma must be promoted, including raising awareness of the processes and the added value of active citizenship;
- The European institutions and national and local administrations should reflect the diversity of the EU population. This will also require actions to strengthen human resources within Roma communities.
- Attention to the proportionate representation of all segments of the Romani community should be paid with particular attention to gender, age, sexual orientation, etc.

ENAR urges Roma citizens, community organisations and leaders to:

- Mobilise to stand up for their rights and for policy change
 - Encourage political participation of Roma people in local, national and European elections;
 - Citizens direct mobilisation must be enhanced, as it is crucial to ensure sustainable change;
 - Empowerment and grassroots mobilization of Roma as equal and active citizens shall be strengthened, especially with a focus on women and young people as actors of change.
- Encourage large alliances among Roma and non-Roma civil society
 - Cooperation among different Roma groups, without neglecting internal differences, must be promoted, inter alia by supporting regional meetings of Roma NGOs to facilitate dialogue and cooperation;
 - Civil society must truly involve Romany citizens in their activism;
 - A dialogue between Roma and non-Roma on how to achieve better inclusion must be engaged;
 - A special attention shall be given to strengthen alliances and mutual trust and respect between young Roma and non-Roma, as there is a very strong potential and open attitude of civic engagement and volunteering to combat racism and stigmatization, but in case of failure a great danger of growing extremism among young people;
 - Roma and non-Roma organisations should join forces in campaigning for equality and developing joint projects based on mutual respect and shared interest;

- Partnerships between Roma communities, civil society and local and regional authorities must be improved;
- Good practices of cooperation at local and national level must be identified and promoted.

4. Effective policymaking and implementation must be ensured at all levels

So far, Roma inclusion strategies have produced limited results across Europe to actually improve the situation of Roma. Political particularism and bureaucratic myopia need to be challenged. Narrow national interests should not prevent the EU from establishing effective policy-making mechanisms. Policy and decision-makers must adopt a holistic and coherent approach to other relevant policy areas for successful Roma integration strategies, with appropriate coordination and implementation mechanisms.

ENAR calls on the European Union to:

➤ Ensure efficient policy-making

- Policy coherence and mainstreaming with regard to EU Roma policy needs to be ensured vis-à-vis other relevant EU policies such as employment and social policy, the Europe 2020 Strategy, and fundamental rights as an essential pre-requisite for effective policy making;
- Synergies between the different initiatives in place must be ensured (Decade for Roma Inclusion, EU Platform for Roma inclusion, etc);
- Clear linkages must be made between policy, programme and projects, using lessons learned from projects to shape policies;
- Mainstreaming must be combined with specific targeting:
 - Mainstreaming Roma in all relevant Open Methods of Coordination and other relevant existing mechanisms, including the structural funds;
 - Target policies and interventions for short and medium term improvement;
- Common indicators must be collectively defined and used to measure the situation of minorities, including Roma; these indicators should include better community cohesion and better life chances;
- Links with the EU enlargement process must be ensured, in particular Western Balkans countries must be bound by the 10 Common Basic Principles on Roma Inclusion and integrated in the European Framework;
- Gender sensitive and age-sensitive policy-making must be promoted.

➤ Ensure efficient policy implementation

- Effective control mechanisms should be implemented to monitor national and local Roma inclusion policies;
- Appropriate sanctions must apply in cases of failure of implementation;
- Conditionality in the allocation of funding must be implemented, including institutional guarantees for the enforcement of the principle of non-discrimination and equality, the elimination of segregation, assurance of equal access of Roma to public services, decreasing gap between minority and majority;
- Window dressing programmes must be avoided, the EU must ensure that projects it supports are making a real difference to people's lives;
- Lessons must be drawn from failed projects to learn which practices do not work while continuing to share best practices;

- A reliable ongoing multiannual budget should be dedicated to Roma inclusion, as an essential for policy-based social inclusion initiatives;
- Projects must be sustainable, with a longer time coverage and enough flexibility so that bureaucracy does not put an end to promising local projects;
- Accessibility of the different European facilities for funding to grassroots organisations must be ensured, including simplified and accelerated procedures;
- The Framework should provide for strengthened coordination between EU funding streams to promote Roma inclusion – namely the Regional Development Fund, the Social Fund, the Rural Development Fund and other relevant EU funding programmes;
- Relevant EU funding streams should be amended to include Roma inclusion as a horizontal priority and to promote complex approaches to inclusion.

ENAR calls on Member States to:

➤ Ensure efficient policy-making

- National Roma Integration Strategies should adopt and elaborate integrated approaches to Roma Inclusion to reflect the multidimensional nature of Roma exclusion;
- Coordination mechanisms must be established between horizontal and vertical actors at national level with clear lines of responsibilities and accountability, in particular regarding the role and a clear mandate of a national point of contact for Roma integration;
- Member States and local authorities should set national and local targets for Roma inclusion in employment, education, health and housing with a particular focus on improving Romani women's rights.¹⁷

➤ Ensure efficient policy implementation

- Awareness must be systematically raised of the Framework's process and of Roma's rights, to make sure that the whole population and in particular the most marginalised people are aware of the National Strategies and of the opportunities they offer to them;
- Monitoring and reporting mechanisms must be put in place based as much as possible on data disaggregated by ethnicity and gender and if necessary, a strategy to enhance disaggregated data collection must be included;
- At the decentralised level, addressing the lack of capacity to implement policies and access EU funding should go hand in hand with tackling direct and indirect discrimination in administrations.

Conclusion

If the EU and its Member States are to be successful in curbing Roma exclusion and preparing all their citizens for a more inclusive, diverse and more competitive Europe of the future, a change in

¹⁷ The European Parliament resolution on the Situation of Romani women in the European Union adopted in 2006 highlighted that Romani women continue to face the greatest level of discrimination throughout Europe and urged public authorities in the EU to ensure Romani women and girls equal access to education and health care, including an end to segregation in schools and hospitals, see: European Parliament, Resolution on the Situation of Romani Women in the European Union: <http://www.europarl.europa.eu/sides/getDoc.do?pubRef=-//EP//TEXT+TA+P6-TA-2006-0244+0+DOC+XML+V0//EN&language=EN>

approach to Roma inclusion is required at all levels. ENAR strongly believes that all the parties involved should rise to the challenges of promoting a progressive narrative on equality and diversity, while ensuring the respect and fulfilment of Roma fundamental rights, and encouraging their active citizenship.